



Republic of Burundi

National program for food security and rural development of Imbo and Moso "PNSADR-IM "

Mid-term review report

Project area	Provinces of Bubanza, Bujumbura, Cibitoke, Rutana and Ruyigi
Field days	From November 13 to 17, November 19 and 22, 2018 (7 days)
Sites visited in the field	Communes of the provinces of Ruyigi (Gisuru and Kinyinya), Rutana (Giharo and Gitanga), Bujumbura (Mutimbuzi), Bubanza (Gihanga and Mpanda) and Cibitoke (Rugombo)

Mission Dates: November 12 to 30, 2018
Document Date: 7-Dec 2018

Eastern and Southern Africa Division
Programme Management Department

Note: The conceptualisation of the Simplified Access Procedures proposal to be financed by the Green Climate Fund titled "**Climate proofing food production investments in Imbo and Moso basins in the Republic of Burundi**" was an outcome of the Mid Term Review of the PNSADR-IM. This report is submitted as the feasibility study for the GCF financing. It articulates the need to climate proof the investments made in the Imbo and Moso basins.

Abbreviations & acronyms

ACSA	Community Animal Health Officer
ASC	Community health worker
BIF (FBU)	Burundian Franc
BMP	Runway maintenance brigade
BPEAE	Provincial Office for the Environment, Agriculture and Livestock
BRB	Bank of the Republic of Burundi
CCL	Milk collection center
CCDC	Communal Community Development Committee
CDC	Community Development Hill Committee
CNIA	National Center for Artificial Insemination
COSA	Health Committee
CSO	Strategic Orientation Committee
CSCB / P	Community / beef or pork solidarity chain
CTP	Technical Steering Committee
CAD	Tender documents
DGE	Directorate General of Livestock
DNCMP	National Directorate of Public Procurement Control
DPAE	Provincial Directorate of Agriculture and Livestock
DRF	Fund Withdrawal Request
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
FARN	Home for learning and nutritional rehabilitation
FFS	Farmers Field Schools
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
GAFFSP	Global Agriculture and Food Security Program
GPC	Pre-cooperative group
GSADR	Agriculture and rural development sector group
GdB	Government of Burundi
HIMO	High labor intensity
IA	Artificial insemination
IEC	Information, Education, Communication
IBIS	High-performance brood registration software
IMF	Microfinance institution
ISABU	Institute of Agronomic Sciences of Burundi
MARP	Accelerated Participatory Research Method
MINEAGRIE	Ministry of the Environment, Agriculture and Livestock
MUA	Marsh users association
OFID	OPEC Fund for International Development
WFP	World Food Program
PNSEB	National Fertilizer Subsidy Program in Burundi
PTBA	Work Program and Annual Budget
SEAD	Automated and decentralized monitoring and evaluation system
SESG	System for recording and monitoring efficient broodstock
VAT	Value added tax
TVC	Communal veterinary technician
UFCP	National Program Coordination and Facilitation Unit
UFCR	Program Coordination and Facilitation Unit at regional level

A. Mission objectives and key conclusions

A. Mission objectives and key conclusions

Context and main objective of the mission

The joint IFAD / GoB mid-term review mission of PNSADR-IM took place in Burundi from 12 to 30 November 2018. Its objectives were to: (i) assess the physical and financial progress made and collect the lessons from program implementation; (ii) ensure that the implementation strategy and approaches will achieve the development objective and guarantee the sustainability of the results; (iii) review the adjustments made by the supervision missions and, if necessary, make a proposal for guidance according to the current socio-economic context and the target groups; (iv) assess the performance of service providers and implementing partners; (v) verify that the monitoring system allows results-based management; (vi) identify and measure the mid-term effects of the program activities on the beneficiaries; (vii) review administrative, accounting and financial management, including the degree of implementation of the recommendations of account audits; (viii) review the procurement plan and the constraints encountered; (ix) confirm that the monitoring-evaluation system meets IFAD and GoB standards and provides information useful for decision-making; (x) make proposals on the basis of a comprehensive diagnosis of change or reinforcement which increase the effectiveness and efficiency of the program in its second period; and (xi) update the logical framework, the COSTAB, and if necessary, make a proposal for the reallocation of funds by categories in Annex 2 of the IFAD / GoB financing.

During its time in Burundi, the mission held working sessions with the program team for the presentation of the results of the activities under review in the presence of representatives of MINEAGRIE and partner service providers. She visited municipalities in the program intervention area, met local authorities, partner operators, decentralized structures, Farmers' Organizations to collect their opinions and suggestions.

At the end of the mission, a summary meeting took place on November 29, 2018 with the program team and a feedback meeting was held on November 30, 2018 at the Program headquarters in the presence of the Permanent Secretary of MINEAGRIE, a representative of the Ministry of Finance, Budget and Economic Development Cooperation, members of the Technical Committee and the Governors of the Provinces in the intervention area. This report presents the main conclusions and recommendations of the mission.

Findings and main conclusions of the mission

Despite a difficult start in 2015, the PNSADR-IM recorded in 2018 a remarkable advance compared to the findings of the last supervision mission in November 2017. Significant efforts were made by the program team and a real development dynamic was carried out in the direction of the beneficiary populations with results now visible in the field. The findings and main conclusions of the mid-term review mission are corroborated by the observations made during site visits, interviews with beneficiaries and partners, as well as the preliminary results of the surveys carried out as part of the study on the mid-term evaluation of the program's effects.

The studies relating to hydro-agricultural developments (with OFID co-financing) are now all completed and work has started. The studies were long but essential in view of the volume of work to be carried out, the complexity of the field, and the validation process required at different stages. These studies made it possible to ensure that the developments to be undertaken do not affect the balance of the ecosystems. At the same time, the program focused on protecting watersheds. However, the chances of proceeding to the final acceptance of the works and of settling the contracts entered into before the completion of the program will be ensured if OFID aligns the closing date of its funding planned for October 2019, with the closing date of GASFP funding scheduled for March 2021. A schedule for monitoring and transferring hydro-agricultural structures has been prepared jointly by the mission and the coordination team in order to ensure a successful disengagement from the program in this regard.

Overall, the results are positive and **the overall performance of the program is moderately satisfactory**. At mid-term, the number of households benefiting from PNSADR-IM services is 45,026 (i.e. 81% of those planned), 33% of which are headed by women. At the level of component 2 "Development of supply chains", the achievement rates are appreciable around 50%, even 100% for the community structuring of MUA, rice and dairy cooperatives, FFS/ SRI, and storage sheds. Tangible

improvements are noted in financial management, procurement and monitoring and evaluation. The disbursement rate doubled from 2017 to 2018 (from 22 to 40% for all donors combined).

For the remaining period of program implementation (2019-2020), the mission is of the opinion that the strategy, objectives and intervention area are relevant and remain unchanged. Targeting is participatory and inclusive according to the criteria defined by the program strategy. The logical framework has been reviewed and completed. The cost table was updated on the basis of the results obtained and the final targets revised mid-term. If the initial program completion date scheduled for 30 September 2020 remains unchanged, a reallocation of funds by categories on Annex 2 to the IFAD / GASFP financing agreement will be necessary in order to take into account the updating of unit costs, final targets revised at RMP, activities in support of women and resilience to the effects of climate change not taken into account in the initial design of the program. In order to further improve the level of disbursements, the public procurement threshold authorized by IFAD should be increased and the amount of the initial deposit in the designated GAFSP account should be increased from US \$ 2.5 million to US \$ 3 million to avoid cash shortages. The GoB must send a request to OFID to align the closing date of its funding with that of the GAFSP fund on March 31, 2021. Finally, the program must now finalize its disengagement strategy and start progressively in 2019 on transfer of knowledge to grassroots organizations and decentralized long-term structures.

B. Project overview and main progress

Overview

According to the data from the survey report on the evaluation of the mid-term effects of the PNSADR-IM carried out in 2018, the rate of achievement at community structure level is satisfactory. The seven (7) Marsh User Associations (MUA) set up are operational and include 22,093 members (compared to 11,000 planned) of which 24% are women. The capacities of the 20 rice cooperatives and 7 dairy cooperatives set up have been strengthened and around 40% to 70% of their members declare having improved their incomes and their food security thanks to the increase in production.

The studies on the hydro-agricultural developments are finished and the works are started for 808 ha on 2470 ha planned. The program focused on the protection of 5983 ha of watersheds (41% of planned) and thanks to HIMO works, 7533 temporary jobs were created (against 4000 planned) including 40% for women and 57% for youth. Likewise, 130 permanent jobs have been created within cooperatives (rice, dairy) and for community animal health workers. In addition, the program rehabilitated 24 km out of 100 km planned and carried out 22 km of new tracks out of 150 km planned. The program has focused on less costly rehabilitation than new construction. This choice, which also responds to the choice of beneficiaries, also has the advantage of shortening lead times to open up the maximum number of sites and facilitate the flow of production to storage facilities and marketing centers. The runway maintenance brigades (37 against 20 planned) have been set up and training has been provided.

For component 2 "Development of supply chains", the execution rates of the activities are satisfactory and are between 50% and 80% for support for rice production, the cattle solidarity chain, training via FFS or even 100 % for the multiplication of seeds or the training and equipment of the 70 community agents in animal health planned.

The application of SRI through 154 rice FFSs and the training of small farmers and supervisors improved rice yields by 40% in the Imbo region (from 3.8 to 5.3 tonnes / ha) and 60% in the Moso region (2.3 to 3.8 t / ha). Thanks to the facilitation of the program, the storage stores set up (9 of which 3 are committed out of 22 planned) made it possible in 2018 to store 1,800 tonnes of paddy rice in the form of warrantage with access to financial services where each member could benefit from a credit of approximately 210,000 FBU (approximately \$ 120) without injecting equity.

The animal community solidarity chain with 3,180 beneficiaries of cattle (including 482 women) out of 2,825 expected (113%) and 1,836 beneficiaries of pigs including 355 women gave good results (80% achieved). This support has produced positive effects thanks to the increase in the number of 2nd and 3rd generation of 371 cattle and 1,415 pigs. The artificial insemination component with an adoption rate of 74% made it possible to produce 3246 good quality calves, 83% of the households surveyed said they were satisfied with the services provided and there was an improvement in access to veterinary care. The component has the advantage of reducing imports of cattle in the medium term.

From a nutritional point of view, vegetable gardens have improved the situation in school canteens with the effect of an increase in success rates and a decrease in dropouts. With the support of the program, 33% of target households have benefited from training through the Learning and Nutritional Rehabilitation Homes (FARN).

Component 3 "Coordination, management and monitoring and evaluation" recorded an average implementation rate estimated at 61%. The average disbursement rate for all donors increased from 2017 to 2018 from 22% to 40% (all donors combined) with the DRF being processed. Thanks to the management support provided to the program in 2017, there is an undeniable efficiency in the monitoring-evaluation system, reporting, good management of the procurement component and improvements are noted in financial and accounting management compared to 2016 and 2017. The audit reports are produced on time, no management deviation is noted and the situation of funds in the designated account is up to date.

On the date of the mission, the total disbursement (all donors combined) was 21.032 million USD, out of an actual allocated amount of 58.4 million USD, or 36.02%. Disbursements by donor are as follows: 42.83% on the GAFSP grant, 89.63% on the IFAD grant, 18.47% on the OFID loan, 38.83% on the Government counterpart, and 118.79% for beneficiaries. The low OFID and Government disbursement rates are due to delays in hydro-agricultural works.

Main progress

Component 1: Reinforcement of hydro-agricultural infrastructure and opening up

At mid-term, progress in terms of the 4 S / components is as follows:

Hydro-agricultural developments. This S / component is funded by OFID. The objective is to develop 7 marshes for a total area of 2,470 ha. The studies were long and lasted approximately 1 ½ years due to the limited human resources involved in relation to the volume of work, the complexity of the terrain, and the very long process of validation of the various stages in order to ensure that the developments do not affect the balance of ecosystems. On the date of the mission, all the planned development studies have been completed (6 marshes in the provinces of Rutana and Ruyigi and the irrigated perimeter of Rukaramu). The contracts for the development of 1010 ha have been signed and work has started for 808 ha. The remaining 1,460 ha are in the procurement phase. Since the OFID financing agreement is only for 4 years, it is recommended that the GoB send a request to OFID to align its closing date (October 2019) with that of the IFAD / GAFSP agreement (March 2021) in order to allow the reception of the works according to the required procedures and a successful disengagement of this S / component. *The mission noted on the ground that support to the land offices of 3 communes (Gihanga, Kinyinya and Rugombo) will be necessary in order to secure small producers.*

Protection of watersheds. At the level of this S / component, tangible results were recorded with i) the production of 4.6 million agro-forestry plants, ii) the digging of 2772 km of anti-erosion ditches and, iii) the reforestation of 236 ha of hill ridges. In total, the program supported the protection, including reforestation, of 5,983 ha of watersheds against a target of 14,700 ha (41%). The planned community organizations are in place with 6 watersheds monitoring committees and 62 nursery groups. To prepare for the post-project, *the mission recommends identifying groups of nurserymen who have the potential for empowerment, in order to help them develop into profit-making associations (ABL).*

Reinforcement of the management capacities of users of hydro-agricultural infrastructures. The program set up and trained all the producer organizations planned for the 7 marshes (8 MUA, 8 brigades for maintenance of facilities, 8 associations of paralegals for the settlement of land disputes). The maturity and operational levels of the different structures are variable, *some still require support and others regular monitoring in order to gradually prepare for their empowerment.*

Opening up production areas. At the end of the project, it is planned to i) rehabilitate 100 km of tracks and ii) build 150 km of new tracks. The rehabilitation studies have been completed and the works have started and 24 km of the rehabilitated tracks have already been received (25%). For new runways, a single 22.3 km section is under construction. The runway maintenance brigades (BMP) are in place (37) and theoretical training has been provided to them. However, companies are experiencing difficulties in supplying construction materials due to the temporary suspension by the GoB of the extraction of construction materials in order to better control their impact on the environment.

Component 2: Development of the sectors

Halfway through, progress in terms of the 3 Sub components is presented below.

Development of the rice sector. The achievements relate to the rice production and rice valorization components.

Rice production. Support focused on i) the distribution of rice kits (seeds, fertilizers, phytosanitary products, various materials, etc.) to 863 households out of the 1,000 planned (86%), ii) the development of a harmonization strategy of the FFS approach within the framework of the IFAD-FAO initiative, iii) training / retraining of 313 master trainers and FFS facilitators out of the 450 planned (70%), iv) the establishment of 154 rice FFS out of 300 planned for the benefit of 3664 producers, 55% of whom women, v) the production of 59 tonnes of certified rice seeds out of the 120 tonnes planned (49%), and vi) the provision of 1,875 tonnes of fertilizer to 7,450 households as part of the contribution to National GoB program for fertilizer subsidy. In terms of rice CEP, satisfactory results have been obtained with yield increases of 3.5 to 5.3 tonnes / ha (40%) in the Imbo region and from 2.3 to 3.8 tonnes / ha (60%) in the Moso region.

Rice enhancement. The activities focused on i) carrying out 2 feasibility studies for the establishment of the storage sheds on 3 planned, ii) the construction of 6 stores each equipped with a drying area on 22 planned and 3 others already engaged, and iii) the installation of 5 hullers out of 11 (45%). On some sites, access to electrical energy remains a constraint for the functioning of hullers.

Development of the milk sector. The achievements relate to the following components:

Strengthening of local cattle production capacities. The Program supported the national center for artificial insemination (CNIA) in equipment, seed production, training of local inseminators and artificial insemination acts. On the date of the mission, the CNIA produced 10,495 AIs out of the 40,000 planned and obtained 3,246 calves out of 14,100 planned (22%). This activity contributes to strengthening the country's capacity in the production of heifers to reduce imports. Some of the centre's equipment was acquired several years ago and has become obsolete, so it is necessary to support the CNIA for its repair or renewal and provide it with technical assistance to strengthen the training of inseminators.

Improving animal health. The training and equipment of the 70 community animal health workers (ACSA) was 100% completed. To protect the cattle herd, the program should continue to support the Directorate General of Livestock (DGE) in the fight against epizootics.

Extension of forage crops. Eight (8) associations of fodder seed multipliers are in place (100%) but production remains insufficient. Within the framework of the policy of permanent stabilization of the cattle set up by the GoB, it is necessary to improve this component by setting up more associations, providing them with the necessary plant material, training them and strengthening their organization and management skills for a successful transfer.

Bovine community solidarity chain. 3,180 cattle were distributed to the beneficiaries compared to 2,825 planned (113%). The chain has already supplied 371 cattle to second-generation beneficiaries.

Farming field schools for livestock (CEPE). The 73 CEPEs set up (out of 70 planned) have trained 2,479 beneficiaries, including 1,490 women (60%), and this has improved livestock feed and health.

Milk development. Support focused on i) setting up and equipping 3 out of the 9 milk collection centers planned (33%), ii) building and equipping 8 out of 18 secondary milk collection centers planned (44%). The weak points identified are i) the low level of consultation of all the actors active in the sector and (ii) the insufficient equipment to meet the demand of buyers from the private sector.

Diversification and support for nutrition. The progress recorded by this S / component is as follows:

Promotion of secondary sectors. Support focused on 6 speculations identified in a participatory manner with producers. They enabled i) the production of 10.5 tonnes of maize seeds out of the 40 tonnes planned (26%), ii) 880 kg of certified peanut seeds, and 8 tonnes of consumption peanuts, iii) 1 tonne of certified soybean seeds, iv) 21 tonnes of tomato, v) distribution of 22 tonnes of hybrid corn to 4,360 producers, and vi) distribution of 19,700 fruit plants. The program should refocus on a limited number of crops, paying particular attention to unconventional sectors (mushrooms, fish farming) which are attractive sources of income for the most vulnerable.

Pig industry. Of the 1000 planned, 1,836 households, including 355 women (20%) in category 2 (less than 0.5 ha) benefited from pigs to improve their income through the sale of piglets and the use of manure for their farms. The solidarity chain worked well since 1,415 other households benefited from 2nd and 3rd generation pigs.

Fish poisoning. The program supported 18 fish farming sites with the distribution of 200,000 fry and feed and the training of 124 beneficiaries. The mission is of the opinion to further strengthen integrated fish farming (poultry / pig farming) according to the model implemented by MINEAGRIE.

Support to nutrition. This component mobilized 754 community actors on behavioural change and the adoption of good eating practices through 16 awareness / mobilization sessions. As part of the management of moderate acute malnutrition at community level, 31 FARN sites out of 135 planned have been set up (with 51 sessions), 4,687 children under 5 years of age have been identified, including 475 with moderate acute malnutrition successfully screened and treated. To promote food diversification and prevent malnutrition, 2,422 households benefited from inputs for their vegetable gardens. This component should continue and be extended to more poor households by providing them with complete kits (vegetable gardens / pigs / market gardening equipment).

Component 3. Coordination and management

Program coordination is well conducted and there is very close interaction with decentralized structures and partner institutions. Consultations are regularly organized and this promotes ownership and respect of the national development strategic framework. The program made significant progress in 2018 in terms of disbursements (+ 20% compared to 2017) and production of 37 DRF (37) and DNO (114 for 2018 alone) at the end of October 2018. The DRF are updated and the activity and financial reports as well as the audit reports were submitted on time. The 2018 AWPB accompanied by the procurement plan was submitted and approved within the required deadlines.

The monitoring and evaluation system is efficient, allows the program to be managed and the data is available. The logical framework was reviewed and updated at mid-term. In knowledge management, the program replicated good practices and capitalized on peasant knowledge acquired by previous and ongoing projects (SRI, artificial insemination, FFS, FARN / FAN, etc.). In the area of communication, progress has been made in disseminating information on the achievements of the program. Emphasis should be placed on the promotion of milk consumption and in the field of nutritional education.

C. Project implementation

i. Efficiency and focus on development

Efficiency

Justification of the note. Before the development of the marshes, the program anticipated social engineering work by setting up and training POs, supporting agricultural intensification and diversification. Some cooperatives have reached a good operational level and provide services to members. Implementation rates have reached 50% or more for the production of certified seeds, farmer rice and livestock farming fields, cattle and pig community solidarity chains, etc. Delays in carrying out the studies affected the development of marshes and tracks which did not start until 2018. **The performance is rather satisfactory.**

Logical framework analysis and main efficiency issues

After 4 years of implementation, the program has reached 81% of targeted households. Out of 50,000 jobs planned, 8,700 were created (17%), of which 5,323 jobs for young people out of the 15,000 planned (36%). The protection of watersheds against erosion affected 5,983 ha out of the 14,700 planned (41%). Work on the development of the marshes did not start until 2018 on an 808 ha site. This delay is due to the little interest shown by the foreign design offices to tender, to the validation process of the different stages of the study, and to the slow procurement procedures. Eight MUAs have been implemented out of the 7 planned (114%). Out of 250 km of planned tracks, 24 km have been rehabilitated, 22 km of new tracks started, and 37 of the 20 track maintenance brigades planned (168%) have been set up and trained. Rice yields increased by 40% in Imbo and 60% in Moso following a combination of services offered by MUAs and cooperatives (inputs, training at FFS level, etc.). The members of POs benefiting from the services is 87%. Out of 300 FFS/ SRI planned, 154 have been set up for the benefit of 3,664 members, of which 2004 are women. Out of 22 rice storage infrastructures planned, 6 have been built and 3 are in progress and out of 11 rice processing equipment planned, 5 have been installed. The rice and milk sectors have made significant progress with 27 rice and milk producer organizations, with 13,520 members including 3,736 women (28%) established out of the 31 planned. The percentage of households with access to rural financial services stands at 52.3%. Out of 2,825 cattle planned, 3,180 (113%) were distributed.

Focus on development

Targeting and awareness

Justification of the note. Participatory targeting is carried out in a hill general assembly according to the methodology adopted by the country program and involves all the actors. It is inclusive and takes into account women and young people. The awareness of the beneficiaries was facilitated by the social engineering work which set up and trained the POs. Program supports are adapted to the needs of each category. The program reached 44,026 households out of the 55,575 planned, 33% of which were headed by women. **The performance is satisfactory.**

Gender equality and women's participation

Justification of the note. Women are taken into account and participate in program activities. Women's access to economic resources has been reinforced: 15% are beneficiaries of cattle, 22% members of MUA, 29% members of rice cooperatives and 21% members of dairy cooperatives. The participation of women in secondary sectors varies from 24% (pig sector) to 50% (tomato sector). The proportion of women is 55% in rice FFSs and 60% in livestock FFSs. The program has increased the participation of women in decision-making bodies: 30% in the CCDC / CDC, 40% in the committees of dairy cooperatives and 38% in the MUA committees. The performance is moderately satisfactory.

Highlights and main issues

The initial program design report had not planned specific activities for women and vulnerable category 1 households in order to strengthen their operational capacities. No activity intended to alleviate the arduousness of the woman's domestic work was planned. No staff member is responsible for monitoring gender parity in the Program Facilitation and Coordination Unit. The mid-term review proposed new activities (improved stoves, rainwater collectors) that will allow women to integrate more fully into producer organizations (POs) and economic circuits, to participate and / or benefit from more support from the program in order to be independent.

Agricultural productivity

Justification of the note. The program anticipated the structuring, training of POs and support for agricultural intensification before the development of the marshes. The good practices learned at the level of rice and livestock FFSs, certified seeds, rice kits, manure and access to subsidized fertilizers have had positive impacts on agricultural yields and production. Yield increases of 3.5 to 5.3 tonnes of rice / ha in the Imbo region and from 2.3 to 3.8 tonnes of rice / ha in the Moso region were recorded. Average rates of yield increases are 5.4% for maize and 3.2% for vegetable gardens. **The performance is moderately satisfactory.**

Highlights and main issues

The anticipation of the program in the structuring, training and support for agricultural intensification before the development of marshes had beneficial effects on agricultural productivity and production. Twenty-seven cooperatives, including 20 for rice and 7 for milk, are in place out of the 31 planned. These cooperatives, whose level of maturity improves each year, provide services to members. Cooperatives have negotiated rice and maize sales contracts with WFP or traders. But other cooperatives are struggling to hull their rice stocks for lack of electricity. These cooperatives will have to sell the rice stocks before the next harvest.

The effects of the rice kits distributed to vulnerable households are manifested in the increase in rice production (more than 50% on average per household) and income (purchase of land or small livestock). In the future, the project will sensitize vulnerable households for the reconstitution of rice kits.

The production of seeds of rice and other secondary crops by groups and / or private individuals provides a solution to the problems of small producers using poor quality seeds. Apart from rice, whose yield increases are significant (from 40% to 60%), the maize and vegetable gardens recorded rates of 5.4% and 3.2% respectively over the 10% forecast; while peanuts, tomatoes and soybeans only record rates below 1% due to their recent introduction for target groups (soy) and climatic hazards. Seed producers will need to prepare to bear the cost of inputs, supervision, inspection and seed certification.

Learning good practices at the level of 154 rice FFS out of the 300 planned gives good results. No FFS was planned at the level of the marshes, developed or not, exploited by the members of certain cooperatives created before the start of the PNSADR-IM nor on the secondary crops supported.

The distribution of 3,180 cattle (113% of forecasts) and 1,836 pigs to first generation beneficiaries, 371 cattle within the framework of the CSCB, the techniques learned at the level of breeding FFSs, the planting of fodder crops, etc. have resulted in increased food and milk production. Out of the 2 million liters of milk planned per year, 892,276 liters of milk (45%) were produced. Artificial insemination has also seen progress thanks to the regional or provincial pools set up.

For the second period, the priorities of the program will be oriented towards: i) strengthening the capacities of cooperatives so that they become autonomous and putting them in touch with the public and private sectors (MFIs, traders) in the framework of winner-winner partnerships, ii) intensification of certified seed production, iii) support to the CNIA for the repair and replacement of defective equipment and training of inseminators for pregnancy diagnosis, iv) support to the DGE for control of epizootics, v) improvement of livestock feed, and vi) strengthening of collection capacities (motorcycles), storage (tanks) of milk and protection of CCL equipment (fencing, lightning rods, stabilizers , etc.).

Nutrition

Justification of the note. The implementation of the activities started late because there was no manager in charge of this component. However, after the latter was recruited following the 2017 supervision recommendation, the program was able to catch up and this component experienced a financial implementation rate of 97% at mid-term. Community mobilizations on the adoption of good eating practices and the establishment of 45 FARN / FAN (33% with 52 sessions) have strengthened the integration of malnutrition care and nutritional promotion. This has enabled the rehabilitation of 475 moderate malnourished children, but important work still remains to be done in the support of households leaving the FARN / FAN. **The performance is moderately satisfactory.**

Highlights & main issues. We can cite the lack of motivation of the light mothers who are responsible for the conduct of the FARNs because of their household expenses and in the fields. Similarly, certain fathers of families who are insufficiently informed object to the presence of their wives in nutrition education sessions. The situation of vulnerability of certain households constitutes a brake in the conduct of FARN sessions because of lack of contribution in terms of local food supply. For this, it is necessary to support households with children leaving FARN through micro-projects to avoid relapses.

Adaptation to climate change

Justification of the note. The frequencies of floods used for the design of road works and marshes do not take sufficient account of the effects of climate change (CC). This is not attributable to the Program as these investments were not planned during the initial design. However, the visit to the tracks showed that the Program is striving to put in place structures that are more resilient to the effects of CC with a strong awareness of the population. The program has also introduced a variety of maize resistant to biotic and abiotic constraints and supports the adoption of short cycle rice varieties, but will have to look for other varieties of food crops adapted to CC. PRODEFI results will need to be scaled up with ISABU.

Highlights and issues.

Additional investments will have to be mobilized to ensure better protection of the program infrastructure against the effects of climate change. It is recommended to (i) establish collaborations with the research institute ISABU to develop varieties adapted to CC, for the main food crops, and (ii) continue discussions with MINEAGRIE to mobilize climate finance to inject into the program for taking charge of climate change adaptation activities.

ii. Sustainability and scaling up

Institutional support and policy engagement

Justification of the note. The program supported MINEAGRIE in the development of a strategy to harmonize the FFS approach and the establishment of consultation frameworks at national and provincial level to institutionalize this approach. He supported him in strengthening continuous and local artificial insemination, local production of liquid nitrogen and bovine seeds. It contributes to the operation of the high-performance animal registration software for animal traceability and monitoring of the CSCB. He also contributed to the peasant forum organized by CAPAD in 2018 on the consolidation of the peasant movement and the implementation of the new law on cooperative societies. **The performance is satisfactory.**

Highlights and main issues

A strategy for the harmonization of the FFS approach was carried out within the framework of the FAO-IFAD initiative. The FFS support system made up of 36 master trainers, trained or retrained, is in place. Facilitators external and internal to the FFSs were also trained. A technical commission has been set up by MINEAGRIE with a view to giving it guidelines for the establishment of a national FFS network. In the field, all stakeholders in the agricultural sector have adopted the FFS approach.

The PNSADR-IM influenced the policy of artificial insemination by supporting the CNIA in equipment and training of inseminating technicians at provincial and municipal level. Regional or provincial artificial insemination pools have been created for the purpose of inseminating cows throughout the year instead of annual insemination campaigns. The PNSADR-IM also supports the CNIA for the local production and conservation of liquid nitrogen and bovine seeds. The birth of artificial insemination calves (already 3,246 calves) will allow the country to reduce imports of cattle and strengthen the policy of restocking cattle.

The program contributed to the peasant forum organized by CAPAD in 2018 on the dynamics and consolidation of the peasant movement in Burundi and the implementation of the new law on Cooperative Societies. The declaration made at the end of this forum will be taken into account in the laws and regulations which will be drawn up by the Government.

Partnerships

Justification of the note. The PNSADR-IM has developed strategic partnerships with several actors: i) the artificial insemination center (CNIA) and the Provincial Offices for the Environment, Agriculture and Livestock (BPEAE) for the design and operationalization of a new AI's national strategy and support to producers, ii) MFIs for the facilitation of access to credit which will be transferred to the new PAIFAR-B microfinance project, iii) the private sector to facilitate the access to inputs and marketing of products; iv) operators in the milk sector to support producers, and v) WFP to facilitate access by cooperatives to markets. **The performance is moderately satisfactory.**

Strengthening human and social capital

Justification of the note. Technical and socio-organizational training is provided to the various infrastructure management structures (MUA, BMP, CDC, CDV, Groupings of Nurserymen), contributing to the strengthening of human capital. However, some managers had only one short session and for others the training did not cover all the aspects required for the roles assigned to them for effective empowerment. The Program must establish a capacity building needs sheet by activity and revise the training modules for the post-project phase.

Quality of beneficiary participation

Justification of the note. The beneficiaries actively participate in all stages of project implementation. There are high rates of adoption of technological packages in agricultural intensification and a high participation in the development and maintenance of rural infrastructure (tracks and watersheds). The beneficiaries' contribution is paid on time. The members of the Cooperatives paid their contribution before the reception of the storage infrastructures. The beneficiaries contributed to the positive results of the protection of watersheds and participated in training on the development and structuring of POs. This structuring is done gradually and there is a strong commitment from the beneficiaries. **The participation of the beneficiaries is satisfactory.**

Highlights and main issues

In the interest of appropriation of the activities by the beneficiaries, the PNSADR-IM and the service providers involve the beneficiaries at all levels. On the ground, the beneficiaries are enthusiastic and actively participate in the activities of the Program. At mid-term, the monitoring of the animal community solidarity chain is mastered by the local communities and displays a certain sustainability. A strong participation of beneficiaries in the production of seedlings at the nursery level is also observed.

The membership rate in rice and dairy cooperatives continues to increase over time. The majority of dairy and rice cooperatives started donating before the hangars and CCLs were built. At mid-term, the contributions of four out of six functional rice cooperatives (57%) already exceed 90% of the amounts required. In addition to the 10% contribution to the costs of infrastructure and equipment, the members of the rice cooperatives bought plots to set up hangars for amounts varying between 12 and 36 million Burundian francs.

The 2017 supervision mission recommended that contributions from cooperatives be converted into working capital for the benefit of cooperative members. For the implementation of this recommendation, the Program should take inspiration from the approach used by other projects.

Responsiveness of service providers

Justification of the note. The PNSADR-IM has five main service providers, including three private (OPP-VA, ACORD and CAPAD) and two public (BPEAE and CNIA) who have good expertise and strong experience in their field. CNIA and ACORD services are limited by the reduced staff facing a large volume of activities. Although the contracts are results-oriented, the providers' reporting contains the information related to the activities and not the products generated by these activities. Certain service providers such as the NGO ACORD, the track design offices and the works supervision offices show good responsiveness. **The performance is moderately satisfactory.**

Highlights and main Issues

The BPEAEs provide exemplary monitoring of the Animal Community Solidarity Chain and agricultural activities. Their regular reporting in the automated and decentralized monitoring and evaluation system (SEAD) constitutes a model which deserves to be extended in other Projects. Thanks to their anticipation and their professionalism, OPP-VA and CAPAD satisfactorily ensure the structuring of rice and dairy cooperatives. However, these cooperatives still display capacity-building needs through exchange visits to experienced cooperatives supported by other projects.

The NGO ACORD has a large volume of activities including the structuring and supervision of producers for components 1 and 2. Despite this, it has a reduced staff which is shared with other projects. It records delays of more than three months in the transmission of reports and invoicing. The mission recommended that he recruit the technicians who supervise the users of the marshes as mentioned in the contracts.

The CNIA ensures the production of seeds, training and monitoring of municipal inseminator technicians. This service shows delays in the transmission of reports and invoicing, causing delays in the payment of fuel and problems with the travel of inseminators. Communal inseminating technicians do not yet sufficiently master the techniques of pregnancy diagnosis and detection of obstetric diseases. Only 35% of municipal inseminators are able to inseminate without the support of the local inseminator.

Design offices: The marshland development studies took delays of an average of 30 months. This is linked on the one hand to the slowness in the execution of these studies by the offices and the engagement of a reduced staff for certain offices compared to the volume of activities and on the other hand to the fact that the Program takes longer to validate each step.

In the rehabilitation of the tracks, there was a delay of 6 months.

Environment and natural resource management

Justification of the note. The management of natural resources and the protection of the environment are taken into account by the PNSADR-IM with actions at the level of the catchment areas of marshes and agricultural areas: digging of FAE, production of agro-forestry plants and adoption banana leaves instead of plastic bags in nurseries which has been widespread. The same is true for the use of organic manures from cattle and pig farms to improve soil fertility. Human resources are trained and community-based RN management organizations are set up. We need to predict dissemination of improved stoves to reduce deforestation. **The performance is moderately satisfactory.**

Disengagement strategy

Justification of the note. PNSADR-IM has not yet developed a disengagement strategy but the activities initiated are key elements of this strategy, and deserve to be supplemented and reinforced. To facilitate disengagement, the program must prioritize i) the promotion of animal and vegetable seed sectors, ii) the facilitation of access to agricultural services, iii) the promotion of investment management mechanisms, iv) the consolidation of platforms for better governance of the sectors and v) strengthening of the public-private partnership. **The performance is moderately satisfactory.**

Highlights and main issues.

The disengagement strategy as conceived at the initial conception aimed at the social appropriation of economic functions by cooperatives and MUAs, the establishment of structures capable of ensuring the post-implementation management of developments, the definition of options on the post-program attachment of the promoted local institutions. The operating mode was based on a process of transferring skills to the various

mechanisms put in place. The achievements that offer options to fuel the process of developing the exit strategy are:

Facilitating access to agricultural services. The PNSADR-IM through a social engineering process has been able to support producers in their structuring into cooperatives and their professionalization in the provision of services to members. Also, the cooperatives and MUA visited currently have various mechanisms ensuring producers' access to agricultural water resources, seeds and fertilizers, infrastructure services and added value equipment (drying area, shed shellers, CCL), etc. These structures have also been able to develop partnerships with the private sector.

Facilitating access to advice and support services. Facilitation of access to advice for the dissemination of good practices with a view to improving productivity was ensured by the program, through the establishment of the first FFS (rice, livestock and secondary sectors) and the encouragement of their reproduction by the Cooperatives, with a view to promoting the scaling up of the FFSs by mechanisms internal to the cooperatives and MUA.

Capacity building for public actors. The PNSADR-IM implementation arrangements were based on "do-it-yourself". One of the essential elements of the program's disengagement strategy was the strengthening of the capacities of public actors with a view to sustainable management of services to producers and the monitoring and evaluation of support. Also, the program supported the structures of the supervisory ministry in various fields and produced the following results: (i) endowment of the ministry in skills for the production of bovine seeds, the realization of AI's acts and the supervision an ACSA's system; (ii) providing the structures of the ministry with equipment (CNIA, BPEAE); (iii) a SEAD designed and in the process of being transferred to the Ministry.

Post program management of achievements by the institutions set up. With a view to ensuring the current and future maintenance of the investments put in place and to come, the PNSADR-IM has promoted, in partnership with the POs, maintenance brigades for facilities and tracks.

Post-program attachment options for local institutions. The local institutions promoted by the program will be linked by (i) the municipalities for the Trail Maintenance Committees, (ii) the cooperatives and MUAs, as regards the FFSs, seed producer associations, brigades maintenance of facilities, service providers specializing in transplanting rice, input shops, etc. (iii) the technical services, in particular the CNIA and the BPEAEs, will ensure the post-program attachment of the ACSAs, etc.

The development of the exit strategy and the implementation of actions that contribute to this strategy (capitalization, regional consultations, studies, publications and advocacy) must be conducted in a coordinated and coherent manner, and benefit from a strong commitment from the implementation teams. However, it will require external skills in social engineering.

Scaling up potential

Justification of the note. The innovations promoted during the implementation of the program are i) the integrated approach to support the supply chains, the structuring of rural demand and the professionalization of POs, ii) the establishment of a permanent supply of proximity artificial insemination services, iii) the one-stop shops for the verification of expenditure, iv) a service common to MUA for the animation of economic functions, and v) the PO / Private partnership to constitute an approved supplier within the framework of the PNSEB. These experiences are still recent and have not yet been documented. In addition, the program does not have a clear strategy for scaling them up. **The potential for scaling up is moderately satisfactory.**

Highlights & main issues

Integrated approach to support sectors. The PNSADR-IM approach, which aims to address the constraints along the rice and milk supply chains, is starting to produce positive results. Prospects for its generalization will have to be based on an in-depth diagnosis of partner POs with a view to upgrading them, the promotion of consultation frameworks involving all stakeholders in the supply chains and the promotion of PPPs to encourage private investment in the supply chains.

Structuring peasant demand and providing services to members. It was ensured by the promotion of 27 cooperatives (13,520 members) and 7 MUAs, with a view to ensuring the organization and supply of agricultural services to producers, in particular through the FFSs for the dissemination of good agricultural practices, the service providers system for rice transplanting, seed producers and input shops for access to inputs, stores, hullers and CCLs to facilitate the marketing of products.

National production of bovine seeds and permanent supply of local AI services. To cope with the limits of the annual artificial insemination campaigns, the PNSADR-IM established a partnership with the CNIA and made it possible to promote national skills in terms of bovine seed production and insemination, then set up a system of 65 ACSA.

PO / private sector partnership. As part of the national fertilizer subsidy program, the TERIMBERE cooperative has pooled its resources (stores) with a private sector to meet the conditions of the Investment Promotion Agency (API) and has been able to constitute itself as an approved supplier. Such experience with a private person active in the purchase of agricultural products can make it possible to build more stable supply chains and encourage dialogue between POs and buyers in order to improve peasant incomes, or even create a joint venture.

Establishment in progress of a cooperative functioning as a "common service" to the 3 MUA of the MPANDA marsh. This peasant initiative aims to clarify the roles between MUA whose mission is centered on the management of facilities and the cooperative which ensures the organization and supply of agricultural services to producers. This innovation, which must be supported, offers references for scaling up in order to control the risks of latent conflicts between cooperatives and MUAs around certain marshes.

Single window for expenditure control. The program has put in place a procedure called "one-stop shopping" for the verification of expenditure relating to funds allocated to service providers. This procedure consists of bringing together the accountants of the BPEAEs and the controllers of the UFCR to verify the expenditure for a certain period in a single session and has made it possible to speed up control, the rapid provision of funds and therefore disbursements.

Cascade training through CEP. The FFS approach was designed to promote cascade training. Indeed, it consists in endowing cooperatives with a first group of FFSs with the objective of duplicating FFSs by the cooperatives themselves. This approach makes it possible to continue the establishment of the FFSs and to reach a larger number of producers.

Scaling vectors. Certain achievements have made it possible to increase producers' incomes, causing an increasingly large demand. Also, this new demand will be taken into account by two ways: (i) the public-private way in the field of AI and animal health and; (ii) the private route, in particular through cooperatives, MUAs and the private sector for access to agricultural services.

iii. Project management

Quality of project management

Justification of the note. The UFCP has a very good understanding of the program objectives and has sufficient capacity to implement the activities and achieve the objectives. The involvement of decentralized structures through the consultation framework promotes ownership of activities and implementation. In 2018, the steering committee met twice and carried out two field visits to support implementation and strengthen decision-making. Program management is in line with national development objectives. Management tools are well mastered by qualified and stable staff. **Program management is satisfactory.**

Highlights & main issues.

Started in 2015 in the midst of a socio-political crisis, the program took off at cruising speed in 2018 and it has made remarkable progress as shown by the volume of disbursements which has doubled in one year. Staff management is well ensured. The performance evaluation for 2017 was made late. Staff should be encouraged to take regular vacation leave.

The program should further decentralize the management of funds and activities to ensure fluidity and speed in disbursements. To do this, he must submit a request to raise the thresholds granted to regional units, provide them with office equipment (computer, scanner, etc.) and install TOMPRO software so that accounting entries and regional expenses are done at the regional level. The mission raised a certain number of points relating to the harmonization of salaries and the classification of staff (case of regional accountants, accounting trainee, in charge of logistics and protocol facilitation) which will be analyzed by the UFCP which will decide to submit requests for non-objection to IFAD for settlement.

Knowledge management

Justification of the note. The project capitalized on farmers' knowledge through the multiplication of experience-sharing visits to beneficiaries of previous projects. This enabled rapid learning of good practices, particularly in animal husbandry. The program produced fact sheets for FFS members. He disseminated success stories and information through communication tools: website, twitter account, Facebook, television, radio and print media. It must further strengthen communication for behavioural change on nutritional aspects through programs and radio spots. The performance is moderately satisfactory.

Highlights & main issues.

The program has increased the number of experience exchange visits and has created a space where farmers' knowledge can be expressed. Thanks to the communication strategy and plan of the country program, the dissemination to the general public of success stories and information on the actions of the program through the communication unit, is done using different communication supports: (i) reports, (ii) videos, (iii) television and radio reports, (iii) radio programs, (iv) posters, and (v) promotional material. The presentations of the results and thematic videos are also broadcasted during the communication day organized each year for project teams, beneficiaries, service providers, the media, development partners, donors and the local and central administration. The channels for the dissemination of knowledge identified by the communication strategy are all exploited, including on social networks. The identified targets are affected by the diversification of the communication media used by the program. The diversification of communication channels and media allows easy access to information and the

sharing of knowledge. The amounts of communication and knowledge management activities are budgeted annually in the AWPB. A person responsible for communication and knowledge management for the country program has been recruited. The diversification of communication channels and media allows easy access to information and the sharing of knowledge. The amounts of communication and knowledge management activities are budgeted annually in the AWPB. A person responsible for communication and knowledge management for the country program has been recruited.

Efficiency

Justification of the note. As of October 31, 2018, the program has consumed 90% of the IFAD grant, and 43% of the GAFSP funding. It was useful to update COSTAB due to certain shortcomings in the initial design concerning the unit costs of certain activities, the application of physical contingencies, the amount of VAT, the introduction of new activities, etc. The accumulated delays of certain activities, such as the development of marshes and infrastructure have an impact, at least for the first years. There are new activities that have been introduced for the vulnerable population, requiring a review of beneficiaries and benefits, and which will compensate for the accumulated delays. **Overall the efficiency is moderately satisfactory.**

Value for money review

The planned activities were carried out at variable rates. Component 1 is behind schedule. The activities are now scheduled for 2019 and 2020, estimated to follow an accelerated pace because many of the contracts have already been signed. The number of hectares of 2,470 ha has been maintained. The works on the watersheds could have been initiated from the start of the program. The rehabilitation of the tracks has lagged behind, but the linear has decreased from 100 km to 163 km. As for the new tracks, the number has been revised downwards from 150 km to 53km. The activities of component 2 were able to continue despite the delays in the development of the marshes and the rehabilitation of the tracks. Even if the activities had started as planned, the program would have faced a unit cost problem for some key activities, for example the cost per hectare for the development of marshes (initially calculated at USD 3,168 / ha, against USD 5,500 / ha now), the rehabilitation of tracks at USD 13,275 / km for a current price of USD 26,000 / km. On the other hand, the cost for new tracks has been lowered, from US \$ 53,800 to US \$ 45,000 / km.

The mission reviewed certain activities to be in line with the objectives of PNSADR-IM. Several measures for category 1 (landless) are therefore proposed to combat malnutrition, and to undertake small income-generating activities. The program rebalanced anticipated activities by reducing non-profitable activities in favour of quick-impact activities. Thus, additional sums of USD 1.2 million and USD 1 million are devoted to the fight against malnutrition and to promising activities. These activities will make up for the delay in profits on the development of the marshes.

Another measure of efficiency was measured by the revision or not of the economic and financial analysis on the basis of the achievements during the implementation period. The mission evaluated the investments and the benefits, year by year (from 2015 to 2018), at the market price and the planning of the remaining investments and revised according to the balance released for the years 2019-2020. Regarding the project gains, there is a delay in the realization of the benefits following on the one hand the initial delay in the financial execution and on the other hand the slowdown in the implementation of investments on the ground, more particularly the development of the marshes and the rehabilitation of the tracks. This could have had a negative impact in achieving the expected short-term benefits. However, the activities of component 2 on the development of supply chains compensated to some extent for the delays in development. The study of the impact effect found that the beneficiaries have already adopted the recommended measures which have the effect of increasing yields for the sectors. The mission did not consider it useful to revisit the economic and financial analysis. The delay in investment / profits is compensated by the profits generated by the increase in yields, as well as by new activities.

The calculation of the economic rate of return, at the constant price of 2015 is 16.3% in the initial report. The report also noted that the program is not very sensitive to changes in aggregate costs and benefits and that the internal economic rate of return is robust relative to changes in costs and benefits and remains at an acceptable level despite that it does not take into account certain direct and indirect benefits.

Consistency between PTBA and execution

Justification of the note. As of 10/31/2018, the financial implementation rate of the 2018 AWPB was 34%. This rate is estimated at 93% at the end of October 2018, taking into account the commitments. Delays in the procurement of marshland development and new tracks delayed the disbursements. The 2018 AWPB is very ambitious compared to the implementation capacities of the program: USD 15.20 Million against an average of USD 7.72 Million for the three previous years. The performance in the consistency and execution of the 2018 AWPB is moderately satisfactory.

AWPB review

The PTBA 2018 review reveals the following implementation constraints: (i) the start-up of the project was very difficult due to the socio-political crisis in 2015 in Burundi, (ii) the markets for hydro-agricultural developments experienced delays because the foreign design offices which have the capacity to carry out the preliminary studies for these installations hesitated to submit their offers, (iii) the delays of execution of the works of rehabilitation of

new tracks, because of the slowness in obtaining certificates of environmental compliance (quarry extraction permit). The analysis of AWP / B in the table below shows that physical progress is not always in line with the rates of financial achievement.

AWPB physical and financial achievements / Year (In '000 USD and%)

Year	2015	2016	2017	2018 *
Planned	3,808	6,662	12,690	15 194
Realized	1,820	4,661	6,522	5,174
% financial	48%	70%	51%	93% **
% Physical	58%	81%	63%	50%

* As of 10/31/2018

** 93% if commitments are taken into account

Performance of the monitoring and evaluation system

Justification of the note. The management software of the automated and decentralized monitoring and evaluation system (SEAD) and the data collection and analysis tools are in place and their exploitation is well controlled. They allow the monitoring of activities, products and effects. The data collected makes it possible to monitor the progress of the implementation of the program, to inform the indicators, to identify cases of success, good practices and lessons learned. They also make it possible to identify the constraints of implementation and to propose solutions. The logical framework indicators are not regularly updated and the quality of the information provided in the activity reports should be improved. The performance of M&E is satisfactory.

Review of the monitoring and evaluation system

SEAD development has been initiated by PNSADR-IM since March 2016 and all projects in the country program have adopted it. Although operational, the SEAD, the configuration of which contains some imperfections, deserves to be updated to take into account the recent integration of the new operational results measurement system (SMRO / ORMS) and the geographic information system (GIS) in the indicator database. The operation of the SEAD is well mastered both at the UFCP and UFCR level and at the level of BPEAE's partners. However, it is necessary to: (i) recruit a computer scientist, at shared cost with the other projects, responsible for the continuous updating and operation of SEAD, and (ii) train / retrain project / program managers, service providers, and BPEAEs in charge of monitoring and evaluation.

The collection, entry and transmission of data is done quarterly according to a previously established calendar. Data collection is entrusted to service providers and partners including the BPEAE.

As in other projects, not all data collectors have the same understanding of the wording of certain indicators. The mission recommends developing a dictionary of indicators and organizing regional training / retraining for data collectors. Training / retraining should be organized quarterly for all users of the software and their partners.

The mission reviewed the logical framework and updated it with the Monitoring and Evaluation Manager and the Component Managers. The mission noted that the transmission of data and the deadlines between the various officials must be improved. The link between the indicators of the logical framework and the indicators of the AWPBs was discussed and clarified to facilitate the technical and financial monitoring of the program. The logical framework is aligned with SMRO / ORMS.

Reports are produced periodically: quarterly, semi-annually and annually and transmitted on time. The data are generally broken down by sex and for certain components also by age.

The frameworks for concertation and coordination of interventions at the provincial level must be strengthened. This approach aims to involve the provincial administration in the organization and monitoring of activities and this strengthens the appropriation of the actions of the Program. The effective involvement of the technical services of the BPEAEs and of the administration has significantly improved social cohesion through the community solidarity chains of cattle and pigs.

PNSADR-IM has set up the automated and decentralized monitoring and evaluation system (SEAD) used by projects financed by IFAD, partner BPEAEs and regional facilitation and coordination units. This software will be transferred to MINEAGRIE for monitoring the performance indicators of all the projects for which it is responsible.

iv. Financial management and execution

Disbursement rate

Acceptable disbursement rate

Justification of the note. The project is in its 4th year of execution with an average disbursement rate of 36.01% for all donors combined. At the end of October 2018, disbursements by donor were: 42.83% on the GAFSP grant, 89.63% on the IFAD grant, 18.47% on the OFID loan, 38.83% on the Government counterpart, and 118.79% for beneficiaries. During the first 10 months, the amount disbursed by the program is 5.52 million USD (12 DRF) or 7.22 million USD, including the DRF being processed. Raising the financial thresholds for a priori review of EDCs

to 100,000 USD and the rapid processing of DRFs (18 days) enabled the project to accelerate disbursements. **The disbursement rate is moderately satisfactory.**

Highlights & main issues.

FlexCub data update: OFID disbursements are not up to date: the DRF paid in 2018 were not taken into account in the HTR and the Status of Funds, i.e. three DRF for USD 1.38 Million. For the GAFSP, the DRF 19 is taken into account in the HTR but not in the Status of fund (USD 0.68 Million).

Recovery of the initial deposit of the IFAD Grant. The IFAD grant has gone beyond the trigger to start repaying the initial deposit. Indeed, the DRF, including the initial deposit, total an amount of USD 896,299.19, 200,000 of initial deposit for a total financing of USD 1,000,000.00. Only USD 103,700.81 remains on the grant account. The program should begin to justify the initial deposit.

Account 58 "transit of funds" shows accounting balances that there is no reason to link to accounting errors. In fact, the use of accounts 58 is necessary for carrying out bank movements (checks, transfers, etc.) between bank accounts and / or the cash register (s) belonging to the program. As the bank reconciliations are correct, account 58 should naturally settle. Financial services should clean up these balances.

Designated accounts: As of October 31, 2018, the reconstitution of the designated accounts is as follows:

IFAD grant

Heading	Amount in USD
Initial deposit	200,000.00
Total amount recovered by IFAD	0.00
Current Outstanding Advance to Designated Account	200,000.00
Designated account balance (BRB 3302/281)	181,572.09
Balance of operating accounts	18,307.59
DRF in preparation	120.32
Total initial deposit justified	200,000.00

OFID loan

Heading	Amount in USD
Initial deposit	1,500,000.00
Total amount recovered by IFAD	0.00
Current Outstanding Advance to Designated Account	1,500,000.00
Designated account balance (BRB 3302/290)	14,930.87
Balance of operating accounts	0.00
DRF being processed and prepared	1,485,069.13
Total initial deposit justified	1,500,000.00

GAFSP grant

Heading	Amount in USD
Initial deposit	2,500,000.00
Total amount recovered by IFAD	0.00
Current Outstanding Advance to Designated Account	2,500,000.00
Designated account balance (BRB 3302/281)	1,087,618.24
Balance of operating accounts	195,785.05
DRF being processed and prepared	1,216,596.71
Total initial deposit justified	2,500,000.00

Designated account balances are reconciled to accounting balances on a monthly basis. No anomalies are noted. The program does not give staff a lead. The supporting documents for advances made to the BPEAE are experiencing delays. The DRFs are current as of September 30, 2018.

Fiduciary aspects

Quality of financial management

Justification of the note. The financial management and internal control system certifies that the funds are used for the purposes for which they were allocated. The recommendation to update the procedures manual has not been implemented. Financial budgets are available and actual expenditure is monitored. The bookkeeping is controlled with TOMPRO and the DRF are automated. The financial statements produced comply with international IAS / IFRS standards and IFAD procedures. The fixed assets register and inventories are up to date but the acquisition and residual values are not indicated. The seven (7) DRF reviewed according to a random sampling (48%) did not show any anomalies. **The performance is moderately satisfactory.**

Main problems. The new Constitution of the Republic of Burundi promulgated in June 2018, establishes a new fiscal calendar whose exercise runs from July 1 to June 30. For this, the program will develop an intermediate PTBA of 6 months (from January 1 to June 30, 2019), then a PTBA from July 1, 2019 to June 30, 2020. It will also have to make any technical adaptations: (i) adapt the software TOMPRO accountant to the new fiscal calendar, (ii) revise the procedures manuals for aspects relating to the fiscal calendar, (iii) revisit, if IFAD requires it, the financing agreement to identify all the clauses that will be subject to amendments and prepare requests to that effect. After a difficult start, the program was able to accelerate disbursements: for the GAFSP for example, The program should provide more support to the BPEAEs to improve the justification of fuel (logbooks, mileage) and bank reconciliation.

Evolution of disbursement rates

Year	2015	2016	2017	Oct. 2018 *
GAFSP	9.23%	14.20%	27.53%	45.40%
OFID	0.00%	8.95%	11.56%	25.34%
IFAD	0.00%	20.00%	57.23%	89.63%
Average rate	5.43%	12.25%	32.11%	38.40%

* Includes current DRF

Quality and regularity of the audit

Justification of the note. The audit report was submitted to IFAD on time (June 11, 2018) and is in compliance with the scope, IFAD guidelines and international standards for ISA auditing. The audit of the project was entrusted to a private firm which expressed an unqualified opinion. The 2018 audit recommendations were not all implemented: one (1) recommendation out of seven (7) was applied and 2 are not relevant, with the exception of the meetings of the Strategic Committee of Orientation and Steering. This Committee made up of Ministers is difficult to assemble. The program presents its accounts in accordance with the Burundian National Accounting Plan. The performance is satisfactory.

Counterpart funds

Justification of the note. To date, the GoB's cumulative counterpart, consisting of transfers of funds, tax exemptions and rent for the program offices, represents only 38.83% of the forecast (or 2.52 million USD). It is affected in particular by delays in the execution of contracts for the development of marshes and new tracks. The beneficiaries' contribution is 1.07 million USD, or 118.79% of the planned amount. The beneficiaries' contribution seems to have been underestimated in the design of the program. The average rate of contributions from the Government and the beneficiaries is 48.56%. The project will continue to strengthen the system for identifying and recording the contribution of beneficiaries. The performance of the counterpart contributions is rather satisfactory.

Compliance with IFAD grant clauses

Justification of the note. Apart from the insurance of the program's office equipment, the clauses of the appendix to the financing agreement are respected. The performance is satisfactory

Procurement review

Procurement

Justification of the note. The PPM was presented and approved on time. The classification of documents relating to the PPM process can be viewed, but it should be improved by inserting dividers by phase of the contracts. The contracts concluded are provided for in the PPM. The PPM and the contract register are up to date. Procurement is open and competitive. Tenders are published in official journals, on electronic platforms and on ARMP websites. The program thwarted false bank guarantees and other administrative documents. This prompted projects to have these documents verified by the issuing institutions. **The performance in procurement is moderately satisfactory.**

Procurement review.

As of the date of the mission, the PPM 2018 has 133 markets with a total forecast amount of BIF 22.30 billion (or USD 12.40 Million). This amount is broken down into works (69.4%), goods (21.3%) and services (9.3%) contracts. The contract register totals 94 contracts with a value of USD 16.39 Million. This mission reviewed 15 contracts with a value of USD 3.21 Million (or 35% of the value of contracts signed in 2018). The mission did not find any particular anomalies.

The program has two (2) disputed contracts and two (2) work contracts at a standstill for which formal notices have been sent to the company. The procurement processes are experiencing delays with 66% of the planned contracts which did not respect the PPM's provisional timing due to the late start of the contracts and delays in the execution of the works. There are several reasons for the delays: i) an internal circuit and unclear responsibilities between the component managers and the procurement managers (who does what from the initiation of the contract to final acceptance), ii) delays in the provision of technical specifications / terms of

reference by the technical components, and iii) delays in the analyzes and proposals for contract award. In addition to internal delays, the execution of contracts also encounters difficulties linked in particular to: i) the weak financial capacity of local businesses which are forced to wait for the payment of invoices introduced to continue the works and ii) difficulties linked to obtaining the administrative documents necessary for start-up and execution, these are mainly authorizations for the extraction of laterite quarries: obtaining them can take several months.

The specific case of rehabilitation of runways in the municipalities of Giharo and Kinyinya by the CREDO company where delays are more than 11 months presents a high risk of non-performance of the contract. Thus, contracts n° 33 / UFCP / PNSADR-IM / T / 2017 and n° 34 / UFCP / PNSADR-IM / T / 2017 from the company CREDO, are to be terminated. Delays at construction sites lead to increases in costs for control and monitoring missions.

Other markets that are experiencing delays impacting the start of work relate to studies of marshes and tracks that have exceeded contractual deadlines. Construction work hangars in the Imbo region are also late.

The auditor's review of procurement recommended a double signature of the RAF and the Coordinator on contracts and various commitments of the Program. In our opinion, the double signature on the contracts is not adequate because the Coordinator commits and the RAF liquidates the commitments with responsibility for controlling the regularity of the expenditure before their liquidation. This recommendation was not followed.

The Government has substantially revised the a priori review thresholds for externally financed markets as follows: (i) Works at 450 Million BIF or 250 Thousand USD, (ii) Supplies and services at 300 Million BIF or 170 Thousand USD. To allow the project to accelerate disbursements and facilitate the procurement process, IFAD should raise the ex-ante review thresholds.

D. Relevance

Relevance

Justification of the note. The program design is consistent with IFAD and government national policies and priorities (food security, poverty and hunger reduction, youth employment, support for women, etc.). It meets the needs of target groups but does not take sufficient account of landless category 1 households. The activities and methods of implementation are well suited to the area of intervention and the local context. The program made the necessary modifications in order to adapt to the changing environment. The design did not set targets for the PMR. If delays are noted in the development of the marshes, the execution of other activities has achieved generally satisfactory results. **The relevance is moderately satisfactory.**

Highlights or main issues. To reach more vulnerable households in categories 1 and 2a, the mid-term review offers livestock activities and other micro-projects as part of the fight against malnutrition. The program will ensure that these activities are implemented and truly benefit the identified target groups. Due to the fact that the initial design underestimated the unit costs of certain activities, the program will not be able to reach all the initial targets, these were resized by the mid-term review according to the budget available and the priorities of the populations.

E. Program changes

Modifications		
Reallocation of funds by categories	Yes	X
Justification. The increase in unit costs compared to those foreseen by the initial evaluation, an inadequate allocation of activities in Costab, the introduction of new activities intended to strengthen vulnerable groups in Category 1 (landless) partly not affected by the initial design and allocation of physical contingencies, as well as taking into account the equipment not produced by the PROPA-O project in the municipalities it shares with PNSADR-IM, required a reallocation on the categories of the GAFSP grant provided for in Annex 2 to the IFAD / GAFSP / GoB Financing Agreement.		
Logical context	Yes	X
Justification. The logical framework has been reviewed and updated. The mid-term targets were specified because they were not defined by the initial design. The targets at the end of the program have been updated to take into account the activities defined according to the amounts reallocated due to the increase in unit costs and the integration of activities in favor of the most vulnerable, in particular women and young people.		
Targeting		
Justification. To further support vulnerable households, additional support will be provided in the nutrition component and integrated fish farming. The total number of beneficiary households will drop from 55,575 to 59,530, of which 27,422 households headed by women (46%).		
Costab review		
Justification. The Costab has been reviewed and updated to take into account the adjustments of the unit costs of the activities compared to those of the initial evaluation. The total cost of the project increased from US \$ 58,400 to US \$ 58,862, an increase of US \$ 0.462 million which will be provided by the national contribution due to the costs generated by the updating of development works. The amounts of IFAD, GASFP and OFID financing remain unchanged.		

Economic and financial analysis

Justification. The economic analysis has been reviewed but shows no major changes. The economic rate of return remains roughly the same as that of the initial assessment (TRE at 16.3%).

F. Lessons learned

Starter kits in the rice and milk sector for vulnerable households

Project	<input type="checkbox"/>	Country	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Region	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multiple-region	<input type="checkbox"/>
---------	--------------------------	---------	-------------------------------------	--------	--------------------------	-----------------	--------------------------

Distribution of rice and cattle inputs, as a starter kit has enabled the recapitalization of vulnerable households with a view to improving their level of production or diversifying their sources of income. The use of the kits is to be encouraged because it allows an increase in rice yields of at least 50% and to promote dairy farms for the benefit of the beneficiaries with an average production of 10 liters of milk per day, during the lactation period, intended for self-consumption, feeding calves and the sale of surpluses to collection centers.

Phasing between social and civil engineering

Project	<input type="checkbox"/>	Country	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Region	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multiple-region	<input type="checkbox"/>
---------	--------------------------	---------	-------------------------------------	--------	--------------------------	-----------------	--------------------------

In the implementation of the PNSADR-IM, the operationalization of social engineering preceded the implementation of the facilities and made it possible to promote structures with a sufficient level of maturity for a better valuation of the investments as soon as they are completed. The cooperatives and MUAs set up, trained and supported in various fields, are already active in providing agricultural services to members even before the rehabilitation of facilities. The right sequencing between social and civil engineering allows for sustainable investment management.

Nutrition

Project	<input type="checkbox"/>	Country	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Region	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multiple-region	<input type="checkbox"/>
---------	--------------------------	---------	-------------------------------------	--------	--------------------------	-----------------	--------------------------

The implementation of nutrition improvement activities within households by IFAD projects and programs in Burundi, has produced satisfactory results leading to an increasing demand from vulnerable groups and placing these interventions at the heart of strategies. reduction in malnutrition. The distribution of the Kits (pigs, vegetable gardens) made it possible to reach most of the most vulnerable households, in particular those without land. Their scaling up improves the nutritional status of malnourished children.

Studies prior to the implementation of facilities

Project	<input type="checkbox"/>	Country	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Region	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multiple-region	<input type="checkbox"/>
---------	--------------------------	---------	-------------------------------------	--------	--------------------------	-----------------	--------------------------

The program's experience in grouping single-lot contracts in order to attract international firms and speed up the completion of studies prior to adjustments did not produce the expected results. This option caused delays in the execution of this activity. It is therefore preferable to treat them in separate batches in order to reduce delays and obtain clearer specific guidelines for each site (APS, APD, DAO).

Support to the milk sector

Project	<input type="checkbox"/>	Country	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Region	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multiple-region	<input type="checkbox"/>
---------	--------------------------	---------	-------------------------------------	--------	--------------------------	-----------------	--------------------------

The PNSADR-IM proceeded to scale up the PRODEFI approach in promoting the milk sector. This support made it possible to support cooperatives by setting up infrastructure and equipment and to facilitate the establishment of partnerships with the private sector with a view to ensuring the processing and marketing of milk. This approach improves producers' incomes and increases the sustainability of investments.

Securing land

Project	<input type="checkbox"/>	Country	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Region	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multiple-region	<input type="checkbox"/>
---------	--------------------------	---------	-------------------------------------	--------	--------------------------	-----------------	--------------------------

Support for the establishment of municipal land offices in charge of registering land and issuing land certificates has helped to reduce land disputes and facilitate access to credit. This experience offers an opportunity for replication in the implementation of the PNSADR-IM to prevent the risk of conflict and strengthen social cohesion.

Support to cooperatives

Project	<input type="checkbox"/>	Country	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Region	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multiple-region	<input type="checkbox"/>
---------	--------------------------	---------	-------------------------------------	--------	--------------------------	-----------------	--------------------------

Some cooperatives supported by the program face constraints of access to energy to ensure the operation of recovery equipment, which will affect the profitability of investments and a shortfall for producers.

Structuring of the Pig Industry

Project	<input type="checkbox"/>	Country	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Region	<input type="checkbox"/>	Multiple-region	<input type="checkbox"/>
---------	--------------------------	---------	-------------------------------------	--------	--------------------------	-----------------	--------------------------

The growth in the number of animals (cattle and pigs) has created a strong demand for food and animal disease control services which remain insufficiently available. The structuring of breeders is essential for the promotion of services to members and epidemiological control through biosecurity measures.

